

Quality Initiative Feedback - Spring 2017

Thank you for a wonderful year thinking about argument mapping and critical thinking! Your participation in the following survey will help us to review the year and plan our next steps. This survey is anonymous, but you will have an opportunity to provide your contact information at the end, if you would like us to reach out to you.

Q1 Did you use argument mapping in your work with students this academic year?

- Yes 8
- No 14

Display This Question:

If Did you use argument mapping in your work with students this academic year? Yes Is Selected

Q2 Please describe how you used argument mapping in your work with students.

- I used argument mapping as it relates to find reliable sources in my Library Resources 101 class.
- Animal Physiology students do group research projects on a question of their own design. We used argument mapping to create biological rationales for their hypotheses in their research proposals. This was very effective in eliminating circular reasoning, but not in articulating a well constructed biological rationale.
- In FYS, for students to unpack arguments in secondary sources on Japan. I tried having them do it themselves, but it was most useful for me to map arguments for them.
- As part of capstone coursework, consideration of a variety of interdisciplinary perspectives. A required group project includes a paper & presentation that begins with students using argument mapping to consider the intersection of a variety of views & supported by evidence from those discipline areas.
- I used argument mapping to help students create outlines for their final papers. We wrote "evidence" onto individual index cards and physically arranged them in multiple ways to explore different arguments and help generate the most convincing one. I also used argument mapping with students as they analyzed musical compositions and found the different characteristics that support an overall theme/concept/conclusion.
- Showed, discussed, applied a simple template during class. Had students each develop one of their own in relation to their topic.
- I created maps of many of the readings we did to help students "see" their arguments.
- I also tried having students create a map of their arguments as part of the planning process toward writing a paper.
- I used it in my Culture and Literature of the Peruvian indigenous of Peru. The mapping concept does work well not only for a relevant conceptual connections related to indigenous women and men, but also showing issues related to both. For instance, in class we look for an issue related to gender. Students looked for key words related to indigenous women. There were several words, such as, mother, wife, daughter, worker, servant, etc. we looks for words related to the power of white against indigenous

women: sex assault, discrimination, exploitation, etc. There were also important issues were related to indigenous man. They were also exploited as workers in the mining business but also they were target as forced conscripts for the army. Students looked for key words related to the issue of indigenous men exploitation, discrimination, racism, etc.

- It was my first time using the mapping concept. Now, I am attending the SoTL at Richland Center and I am learning more ideas of the method. I think that the next time will be even more productive.

Display This Question:

If Did you use argument mapping in your work with students this academic year? Yes Is Selected

Q6 How effective did you find argument mapping to be for the outcomes you desired?

- Extremely effective 0
- Very effective 4
- Moderately effective 4
- Slightly effective 0
- Not effective at all 0

Display This Question:

If Did you use argument mapping in your work with students this academic year? No Is Selected

Q8 Do you think that you'll use argument mapping in your work with students in the future?

- Definitely yes 1
- Probably yes 6
- Might or might not 2
- Probably not 6
- Definitely not 0

Display This Question:

If Do you think that you'll use argument mapping in your work with students in the future?

Definitely yes Is Selected

Or Do you think that you'll use argument mapping in your work with students in the future?

Probably yes Is Selected

Or Do you think that you'll use argument mapping in your work with students in the future?

Might or might not Is Selected

Q11 How do you think you might use argument mapping in your work with students?

- I would like to use it this fall to help mathematics students think about their arguments in an introductory proofs course.
- Cognitive psychology explanation for decision making.
- The best way for me will be to show students how to structure their writing in German with specific emphasis on visibly showing connections between sentences and arguments.
- In helping them learn how to make their own arguments and in helping them see how the authors we read make arguments. I would build it into the whatever process I use to teach them how to write, ask interesting critical questions, and respond effectively.
- I will begin by using it as a pilot assignment in my intro classes. I've worked up a draft assignment based on two opposing arguments of a single historical question. Fingers crossed!
- Learning to analyze and construct good arguments is an essential skill in our field. To the extent that argument mapping can develop and hone these skills, I think it would be very useful. I think I would probably try to incorporate it into some upper level classes.
- I am most likely to use argument mapping in my composition classes since there we discuss argumentation in detail. Argument mapping could be used to help students understand argumentative logic and structure, as well as to distinguish between the argument and rhetorical choices in a piece of writing. This can be helpful for both analyzing and evaluating argument.
- Not sure as I function in a non traditional academic setting.
- Meaning my work with student is not done in the classroom or through large group organized activities

Display This Question:

If Do you think that you'll use argument mapping in your work with students in the future?

Probably not Is Selected

Or Do you think that you'll use argument mapping in your work with students in the future?

Definitely not Is Selected

Q12 Why don't you plan to use argument mapping in your work with students?

- I teach physics, and physics students must master a kind of mathematical logic that doesn't lend itself well to argument mapping. I do want my students to be able to assess their answers, and that's a sort of critical thinking I want to encourage, so I have

attended several of these events to pick up clues about the ways I as an instructor can help students think critically.

Q13 Do you have any recommendations for next steps as this work moves forward?

- Possible having CITL serve as a bridge between interested faculty in different disciplines to partner in this area. Small stipends always get people motivated :-)
- I plan to integrate this framework in every exercise we do that involves primary research. This will help them be able to focus more on the content and less on the mechanics of the exercise.
- I realize this comment is not in the spirit of exploring ideas, but more about the next step in terms of nuts and bolts. And yet I must express that I am very concerned that we are all doing a lot of work that may not blossom if we cannot get a clear understanding of how it will be integrated with some weight and meaning into our Gen Ed program. Honestly, I feel we should really start talking about where it will fit and give it some credits, otherwise it seems too amorphous. Why can't Critical Thinking, which could be taught in any department in a variety of courses, why can't we give it 3 credits at the Foundation level to replace the credits lost for FYS? I really think we need to be having these conversations with the GEC and others. I think this initiative is unique and meaningful, the Provost mentioned it as a Signature Program. But how can we market it without some teeth, some weight, some credits in the Gen Ed program?? I am worried about the next steps on the ground, although I have so thoroughly enjoyed our discussions and training workshops. I second comments that I have heard from fellow participants that this process has been one of the most intellectually stimulating experiences on this campus!!!! Truly!! So many kudos to the organizers and original Critical Thinking Initiative group, and Dona Warren in particular!
- Do we have an online resource center for argument mapping yet? Is there a place where I can see what has happened so far in this movement? (I have not participated in the activities this past year, but am interested in doing some catching up.) Thank you.
- Explain more how it might be used in classes.
- Find a way to integrate critical thinking in the general education program in a credit bearing way. For example, have a course that focuses on critical thinking instead of the First Year Seminar credits.
- I would like to see how other teachers are using argument mapping in their courses. Perhaps they could present their work informally during meetings, or provide videos on D2L, or just a written description.
- Perhaps we would benefit from explaining argument mapping and our university's goals and by showing students how to do this in an orientation. Such would serve to put argument mapping into our university's general culture and vocabulary.
- I would be interested in learning about ways to incorporate attention to opposing viewpoints in argument mapping. This is an area students have always struggled/been resistant to, and the elements of argument mapping that I am familiar with are not conducive to this.
- I would love to see more models of what others are doing!

- Not at this time. I missed some of the meetings, but I plan to use more of the materials posted on d2l when developing my fall course.
- Offer more trainings for faculty in how to do argument mapping and what are some concrete ways it can be used in the classroom.
- Perhaps those instructors who have already used argument mapping in their classes (in addition to Dona Warren) could talk about how they do it and share any tips and challenges they may have. Also, it might be useful to have workshops for interested faculty in which we would engage in some hands-on practice with argument mapping, including the use of websites which facilitate such work.
- I would like to see a published list of "best practices" that encourage students to think better. For instance, if Socratic dialogue is better than other presentation methods, then I would like some tools to help me learn how to facilitate Socratic dialogue in a physics classroom.
- Indeed, I would like some colleagues on campus to show how they use the concept of mapping in their courses.
- " Be resilient in figuring this out the work is valuable.
- Try and come up with some sort of goal or target to for people to work towards even if it is very small and achievable this will help to make things tangible which some people need"

Q14 Do you have any other feedback that you would like to share?

- This has been an awesome professional development experience that has and will continue to inform my teaching.
- I would love for this to be incorporated across the curriculum.
- I really enjoyed the meetings and I appreciated the personal attention I received from the instructors.
- Students struggled at first, but in the end seemed to light up and find pride and dignity in understanding how to argue more clearly. They beamed at being understood and at accomplishing their organization and effectiveness in a smarter and more efficient manner.
- Please don't have every event at noon on Fridays. Some people teach then. Vary the times or go later in the day when fewer people are teaching, please.
- This is an incredible project, and I always leave the meetings feeling inspired.
- Nope!
- Unfortunately I was unable to participate in any of the spring meetings because I was teaching at the time that the lunch meetings were held. I was disappointed because I am interested in learning this skill and hopefully including it in my teaching, but I would need some training in how to do it. I will not be on campus in the fall. If another round of faculty training were to take place in Spring 2018, I would be interested, assuming my class schedule permits.

- I do think this is an excellent initiative because it relates to a key academic and pedagogical issue (critical thinking) applicable to a great variety of disciplines. I support building this initiative into a campus-wide (perhaps "signature") program.
- I'm very impressed with the level of effort (including serving lunch!) you've given to this professional development effort. Thank you!
- "I am pleased that we have the critical thinking gathering. It is so useful Dona's lecture and also the participation of the several colleagues from other departments.
- I would also like to gathering during the academic year because most of the faculty are out of campus during the summer.
- You all did a great job of organizing and coordinating the critical workshops. Thank you.
- I wish I could have participated more. Might be worthwhile to alter your meeting times once in a while to accommodate those who can't make it at the pre-determined time.
- I would have attended more had the if the mtg. time not always fallen inline with another meeting that I felt as more deserving of my attention.